# The State of Diversity, Equity & Inclusion in Business School Case Studies

Center for Equity, Gender, and Leadership University of California, Berkeley Haas School of Business

May 2020

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND	3
Lack of Diversity in Published Case Studies	3
Why do Business Schools Need More Case Studies with Diverse Protagonists & Topics?	Case Studies on DEI 4
METHODOLOGY	5
FINDINGS	7
Protagonist Identities in Published Case Studies	7
Findings in Case Studies with Diverse Protagonists	8
Disciplines	9
Industries and Sectors	9
Geographic Breadth	10
Findings in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Related Case Studies	11
Identity/ies of Focus	11
Target Segment/Population	12
Topics	13
Geographic Breadth	16
Industries and Sectors	16
LIMITATIONS	17
DISCUSSION	19
APPENDIX	25

This report was written by Genevieve Smith and Diana Chavez-Varela with valuable feedback provided by Kellie McElhaney, Jennifer Wells, and Laura Kray from the Center for Equity, Gender, and Leadership at UC Berkeley Haas School of Business.

## INTRODUCTION

Case studies – using real life business situations or imagined business scenarios – are a key pedagogical tool for instruction within management education programs. Case studies are effective and important teaching tools that inform students about business processes, decision making, strategy, and leadership and management challenges. The extent to which case studies are used varies among schools, with Harvard leading the way at an estimated 80% of teaching in its MBA program delivered through case studies as of 2012. However, published case studies used in business schools globally primarily include white male protagonists² and often do not incorporate key topics related to diversity, equity and inclusion (DEI) that are critical for businesses in an increasingly interconnected world and society. Furthermore, while there has been some effort to enhance the number of case studies with diverse protagonists in particular, this does not necessarily translate to an increased use of these types of case studies in classroom settings as professors often use the same case studies over time.

The Center for Equity, Gender, and Leadership (EGAL) at the UC Berkeley Haas School of Business sought to fill this gap by creating a compendium including: (a) case studies with diverse protagonists, and (b) case studies that build "equity fluency" by focusing on DEI-related issues and opportunities. The goal of the compendium is to support professors at the Haas Business School and business schools globally to identify cases they can use in their own classrooms, and, ultimately, contribute to advance DEI in education and business. The creation of EGAL's Case Compendium highlights patterns within published case studies that focus on DEI and/or depict diverse protagonists. This brief will present an analysis of the trends in 1) DEI-related case studies and 2) Case studies with diverse protagonists. In discussing diversity, we define diversity as incorporating the wide variety of shared and different personal and group characteristics among human beings (including but not limited to *Race*, *Ethnicity*, *Gender*, *Age*, *Ability*, *Religion*, *Sexual Orientation*, *Socio-economic Status*, etc.).

## **BACKGROUND**

## Lack of Diversity in Published Case Studies

While the numbers vary slightly and vary depending on the platform that case studies are accessed from, the conclusion remains the same – there is an immense lack of diversity in published case studies. Of the approximately 19,000 cases on Harvard Business Publishing (HBP) Education cases³ (which comprise ~80% of cases used in business schools globally by some estimates), previous HBS faculty have estimated that 1% as of 2017 include a black executive as a protagonist or central decision-making figure⁴ (From our own findings, approximately 1.3% of cases on HBP appear in searches for "African American" or "Black"). An analysis of 73 award-winning and best-selling cases from the Case Center (another main distributor of case studies for business schools) between 2009-2015 revealed that women are protagonists in only 11%.<sup>5</sup> It is unclear how many of these case studies include a protagonist that experiences overlapping forms of discrimination – for example, an under-represented minority (URM) and female – illustrating the likely extreme lack of intersectionality.<sup>6</sup> There is limited information on the percent or number of cases that incorporate concepts of DEI – and when they do, these are often in case studies focused on issues and implications for Human Resources (HR).

## Why do Business Schools Need More Case Studies with Diverse Protagonists & Case Studies on DEI Topics?

The lack of diverse protagonists in cases perpetuates and reinforces a status quo in which traditional business leaders are primarily both male and white. This perpetuates the idea that men are at the center of business and unintentionally depicts strong business leadership as masculine. Showing one model of leadership implicitly signals that women are not suited for leadership and deprives students of alternative role models for leadership identities.<sup>7</sup> Further, even when cases have protagonists that are not white men, case studies often perpetuate harmful stereotypes and gender norms such as women depicted as more emotional, less visionary and less agentic than men.<sup>8</sup> Graduate students exposed to case studies with diverse business leaders may benefit from a role model effect in which students relating to those diverse leaders can have better self perceptions and are more confident<sup>9</sup>, as well as perform better.<sup>10</sup>

The lack of case studies on DEI topics has implications for preparing students adequately for their corporate leadership roles. There are various business benefits for organizations and individuals to promote DEL While this brief will not delve into the business case for diversity, at its core, increasing diversity at organizations is associated with the diversity dividend<sup>11</sup>, i.e., the increase in profits for organizations with more equitable demographics that comes from having a wider range of fresh ideas and backgrounds from which to draw. 12 In addition, more equitable organizations can reduce the incidence of sex-based and other forms of harassment, and thus the associated costs, including reductions in workers' productivity, loss of workers who quit or transfer in the face of harassment and reduced ability to recruit top talent due to reputational damage. Interestingly – and more specific to gender – promoting gender equity and changing the definition of manhood might also help organizations behave more ethically<sup>13</sup> and improve their longterm returns.<sup>14</sup> Beyond promoting DEI in the workplace, companies can also benefit from promoting DEI in their supply chains, as well as in the marketing, sales and distribution of products and services. For example, Unilever's purpose driven brands (which are linked to social purposes related to DEI and/or environmental sustainability) are growing 69% faster than the rest of the business and delivering 75% of the company's growth. 15 As an additional example, Google has and continues to expand its positions with a focus on "equity" across business functions. Teams (some new and several expanding) include, for example: Equity engineering, Inclusive products, Machine Learning Fairness, D&I, and more. The rapid expansion of positions linked to equity include HR / DEI but span beyond. In the Bay area, technology is linked to various implications for equity and inclusion alongside risks and businesses for opportunities. This is further reflected in the 2019 statement from the Business Roundtable reflecting on the purpose of business to commit to supporting all stakeholders, not just shareholders.

Integrating case studies related to diversity, equity and inclusion can (1) foster cultural sensitivity among students<sup>16</sup>; (2) equip students to manage real-life scenarios in which varying perspectives and lived experiences come into play; (3) prepare students for increasingly diverse workplaces where DEI is a strategic advantage; and (4) learn about critical and timely strategies to promote equity and inclusion throughout the business value chain - from leadership ranks and the workplace through developing, marketing and distributing products and services.

Finally, business schools are increasingly prioritizing advancement of DEI in recruitment, the learning environment and in curriculum. Within the top 10 business schools of the world, although there is an

increase in acceptance of candidates representing a wide range of profiles through initiatives such as Minority Recruitment Programs, <sup>17</sup> gaps remain. In the United States, the average proportion of international students in the Financial Times' 2019 top MBA schools was 36.4%, while women account for 34.8% of MBA classes at US schools on average. <sup>18</sup> For US ethnic minorities <sup>19</sup>, at the top 10 business schools, numbers fluctuate between 19.5% (Dartmouth Tuck) and 34.1% (Penn Wharton). <sup>20</sup> Numbers of Black American students are not shared across all schools, but at Harvard Business School 5% of students in 2019 were Black, which was the same as in 2008. <sup>21</sup> This number is reflected in GMAT examinations, where only 8% were Black Americans in 2016. <sup>22</sup> The knock on effect is the industry pipeline - only 3% of executive and senior-level positions within private industry are Black Americans, with 4% for Hispanic Americans. <sup>23</sup> Increasingly, the graduate business education industry is recognizing the importance of improving the representation of more diverse perspectives in their curriculum. <sup>24</sup> Top MBA programs have affirmed their commitment to supporting diversity, equity, and inclusion through initiatives in their own community, teaching, and research as well as through the recruitment of diverse students, faculty, and staff. <sup>25</sup>

Focusing specifically on UC Berkeley's Haas Business School, DEI is a clear priority of the school and Haas has a robust strategy to advance DEI. An integral part of this strategy is advancing recruitment of diverse students. Specifically related to case studies with diverse protagonists, as Haas continues to increase diversity among the student body it is critical these students see people similar to themselves represented as leaders in their business school curriculum. Furthermore, Haas also seeks to advance "equity fluency" among its students who represent current and future leaders in the business world globally. A term coined by EGAL, *Equity Fluent Leaders* understand the value of different lived experiences and use their power to address barriers, increase access, and drive change for positive impact. EGAL offers an EFL course, while Haas also has an EFL emphasis available for students. As a Center at Haas dedicated to educating EFLs to ignite and accelerate change, EGAL understands that the lack of case studies on topics related to DEI poses a critical impediment to achieving our goals and Haas' goals more broadly.

## **METHODOLOGY**

The objective of this project was to discover, select, categorize, and analyze case studies with diverse protagonists and case studies that build "equity fluency" by focusing on DEI-related topics. Specifically, we sought to 1) create a Case Compendium for faculty at Haas and business schools more broadly, 2) evaluate the trends and gaps among the case studies and 3) identify recommendations for writers of cases, faculty, students, and companies.

**Discovery & selection process of case studies:** To discover case studies specific, we began by collating a list of relevant publishers and repositories of business school case studies. Using our knowledge of influential case study repositories we identified 20+ leading publishers. Then we used the following search terms in the search engines of each publisher: *underrepresented minorities, minorities, URMs, black, African American, Hispanic, Latino, Latinx, disability, women, gender, immigrant, refugee, asylee, LGBTQ+, lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, diversity, inclusion and empowerment. In addition to case studies, the search results included articles and journals, which needed to be screened. The first 10 Search Engine Results Pages (SERP)<sup>29</sup> for each website were reviewed in order of appearance (e.g., 100-120 cases) per search term. For Harvard Business School Publishing additional SERPs were reviewed given the sheer volume of cases on this platform. The algorithm of cases prioritized relevance and popularity of* 

the query. Using the search terms on different platforms revealed varied results in terms of the number of case studies with diverse protagonists and cases on DEI-related topics. Many searches resulted in less than 10 pages, in which case all pages were reviewed.

The results displayed on the SERP displayed the title of the case study, a link that pointed to the actual page on the Web, and a short description which shows the keywords that matched with the content.<sup>30</sup> Due to most portals' algorithms, each case study recommended similar cases with keywords related to the initial search terms.

The main platform where cases were gathered from is Harvard Business Publishing. Harvard Business Publishing is considered the leading provider of teaching materials for management education and comprises 80% of cases used in business schools globally by some estimates and includes cases from various institutions and partner collections.<sup>31</sup> Given that this publisher houses the vast majority of business school case studies online, we reviewed additional SERPs for this publication. We also searched for lists of relevant compiled case studies from the different publishers. There was one existing list of "Cases with Female Protagonists," compiled by the Harvard School Gender Initiative. Some cases included in this "Cases with Female Protagonists" list did not include a description of the protagonists' identity in the abstract of the case study, but were still categorized as Gender diversity. There was a lack of specific lists or sections highlighting case studies pertinent to issues of diversity, equity, and inclusion.

Given that the full case studies are behind paywalls, case studies were reviewed and selected based on their abstract. Cases that did not have an abstract could thus not be reviewed. Cases that included a description but did not include the learning objective were reviewed closely to determine if they were suitable for further analysis. In some cases, the search term "diversity" included phrases such as "diversified investment platform comprising hedge funds," "diversity of the investor base", and "a diverse profile." After close review, cases that did not refer to diversity as "DEI" were not included.

**Analysis of case studies:** To conduct analysis of the case studies, we categorized case studies in the following topics: Discipline, Industries and Sectors, Identity/ies of Protagonists (for diverse protagonist cases), Identity/ies of Focus (for DEI-related cases), and Geographic Breadth. Other information tracked on case studies includes Description of the Case Study, Learning Objective, Author(s), Publisher's Name, Publication Date, and Revision date (if applicable). The categories enable easier searching and selection of case studies for faculty based on their interests, as well as enable us to identify trends and gaps.

The list of industries and sectors was based on the U.S. Department of Labor Statistics<sup>32</sup> which includes ten main industries: Natural Resources and Mining, Construction, Manufacturing, Trade, Transportation, and Utilities, Information<sup>33</sup>, Financial Services, Professional and Business Services, Education, Health Services, and Social Assistance, Leisure and Hospitality, Other Services, and Public Administration.

The list of disciplines<sup>34</sup> were drawn from the University of Nevada's College of Business website, given its comprehension and detail.<sup>35</sup>Additional disciplines<sup>36</sup> were incorporated into our list based on the way publishers categorized the discipline of their case study. Potential core courses were drawn from UC Berkeley's Haas School of Business Full-Time MBA Core Curriculum.<sup>37</sup> See Appendix 1 for more details on each topic and categorizations. The list of disciplines includes: Accounting and Finance, Business and

Government Relations, Business Ethics, Business Information Systems, Economics, Entrepreneurship, General Management, Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior, Information Systems, International Business, Law, Leadership, Marketing, Operations Management, Political Economy, Strategy, Supply Chain, and Negotiation.

The identification of identities was based on the description of the case study. We included the following identities in our compendium and analysis: Age, Asylee and Refugee Status, Gender, Immigrant/ First-generation, Ability Status, Political Views, Race/Ethnicity, Religion/ Spirituality, Sexual Orientation, and Socio-economic Status. For the diverse protagonist cases, when not made explicit in the case study description, we tried to confirm diversity whether the individual was diverse in terms of race/ethnicity and gender through online research, but without self-identification of the referenced individuals, these categories are obviously subject to further inquiry. Not all cases disclosed how each protagonist identifies themselves and we did not make any assumptions based on their name. We recognize that people's diverse identity may be hidden, may be fluid or undefined, and/or cannot be simply categorized into "one bucket". We recognize this is limited as the description is likely not inclusive of the various identities a certain individual identifies with.

For each category, we counted the number of cases that applied to the different categorizations and then calculated percentages of occurrence from the overall number of case studies. The percentages are based on the percent the topic is present throughout the 215 cases for DEI-related cases or 215 cases for diverse protagonist cases. Some cases had multiple topics.

## **FINDINGS**

## A. Protagonist Identities in Published Case Studies

Before diving into an analysis of the case studies we collected in our Case Compendium, we provide estimates for protagonists of different identities in published case studies more broadly. Of our search terms, the greatest number of results on Harvard Business School Publishing for "main cases" was for "woman" at 550 results (or 2.8% of main cases on the platform). Adding results from the words "gender" and "she" brings the total "main case" results to 1826 (or 9.45% of total cases). Based on this, we can estimate 9.45% of cases have protagonists identifying as female on HBP. "African American" and "black" revealed 256 results (or 1.3% of main cases on the platform). These numbers match with prior estimates outlined in the background section. See Table 1 for a summary of search term results on HBP. This does not necessarily correlate to percent of cases with protagonists that identify according to these identities, but illustrates if those identities were mentioned in the case descriptions and serves as an estimate.

## Case study & identity search results in Harvard Business Publishing

	Search term results in "main cases" (#)		% of total search term mentions (2950)
Minorities	140	0.72%	5.84%
Black; African American	256	1.32%	10.68%
Hispanic, Latino, Latinx	22	0.11%	0.92%

Disability	44	0.23%	1.84%
Women; gender; she	1826	9.45%	76.18%
Immigrant; refugee; asylee	45	0.23%	1.88%
LGBTQ (Lesbian; gay; bisexual; transgender; queer)	64	0.33%	2.67%

Table 1

## A. Findings in Case Studies with Diverse Protagonists

We catalogued 215 case studies with diverse protagonists". Diverse protagonists are defined case studies portraying people that are not in the predominant and/or most powerful identity groups of a particular sector. In North America, the word "diversity" is often strongly associated with racial diversity or gender diversity. Those are just two dimensions of human reality and two different identities. Diversity also includes differences in sexual orientation, income, ability, and other various domains.

Within the cases identified and entered in our case compendium (including cases from HBP among other publishers), we find similar rates to those identified in the search results. Of the 215 catalogued case studies, 83.72% portray a protagonist with Gender diversity and 28.84% portray a protagonist with diversity of Race / Ethnicity. Most case studies that had identity/ies of focus on Gender diversity had white female protagonists, while most case studies with race / ethnicity diversity were about men. Various case studies highlight more than one identity: 40 case studies (18.60%) explicitly highlight a protagonist with diversity reflecting both Gender and Race / Ethnicity.

## Diverse Protagonists Case Studies: Identity/ies of Protagonists

Identity of Protagonist	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Age	12	5.58%
Asylee and Refugee	2	0.93%
Gender	180	83.72%
Immigrant/First-generation	0	0.00%
Abilities	2	0.93%
Political Views	2	0.93%
Race / Ethnicity	62	28.84%
Religious / Spiritual	2	0.93%
Sexual Orientation	10	4.65%
Socio-economic	2	0.93%
Not specified / General	0	0.00%

Table 2

Only 4.65% of the case studies provided examples of Sexual Orientation diversity. Only 0.93% of the case studies highlighted a character with Political Views, Religious / Spiritual, Abilities, Socio-economic diversity.

## **Disciplines**

The majority of disciplines that included diverse protagonists were Human Resources / Organizational Behavior (40%), Entrepreneurship (25.58%), Marketing (8.37%), General Management (6.51%), and Business Ethics (5.12%). None of the case studies included disciplines of Business Information Systems, Law, and Political Economy.

## **Diverse Protagonist Case Studies: Discipline**

Discipline	Number of occurrences in 215 cases	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
	(#)	
Accounting and Finance	11	5.12%
Business and Government Relations	6	2.79%
Business Ethics	11	5.12%
Business Information Systems,	0	0.00%
Economics	5	2.33%
Entrepreneurship	55	25.58%
General Management	14	6.51%
Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior	86	40.00%
Information Systems	1	0.47%
International Business	1	0.47%
Law	0	0.00%
Leadership	3	1.40%
Marketing	18	8.37%
Operations Management	7	3.26%
Political Economy	0	0.00%
Strategy	5	2.33%
Supply Chain	2	0.93%
Negotiation	1	0.47%
N/A	0	0.00%

Table 3

## **Industries and Sectors**

The most commonly referred industries were Financial Services (21.86%), Information (16.74%), Trade, Transportation, and Utilities (14.88%), Manufacturing (8.84%), and Education, Health Services, and Social Assistance (8.37%). Few case studies highlighted the industry sector of Natural Resources and Mining (1.86%). Only 1 case study (0.47%) focused on the industry of Construction.

## **Diverse Protagonist Case Studies: Industries and Sectors**

Industries and Sectors	Number of occurrences in 215 cases	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
	(#)	
Natural Resources and Mining	4	1.86%
Construction	1	0.47%
Manufacturing	19	8.84%
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	32	14.88%
Information	36	16.74%
Financial Services	47	21.86%
Professional and Business Services	23	10.70%
Education, Health Services, and	18	8.37%
Social Assistance		
Leisure and Hospitality	8	3.72%
Other services (except Public	0	0.00%
Administration)		
Public Administration	8	3.72%
N/A	12	5.58%

Table 4

## Geographic Breadth

We categorized the case studies based on geography and country of focus. Cases where the scenario was focused on 2 or more countries were categorized as Global (7.91%). Although most retrieved cases took place in the United States (66.05%), cases focused internationally mostly took place in Switzerland (2.33%), India (1.86%), and Japan (1.86%). Some case studies (11.63%) did not disclose a particular geographical location.

## **Diverse Protagonist Case Studies: Geographic Breadth**

Geographic Breadth	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
	(")	
Australia	1	0.47%
Belgium	1	0.47%
Canada	2	0.93%
Denmark	1	0.47%
Finland	1	0.47%
France	3	1.40%
Germany	2	0.93%
India	4	1.86%
Japan	4	1.86%
New Zealand	1	0.47%
Niger	1	0.47%
Nigeria	1	0.47%

Peru	1	0.47%
South Africa	1	0.47%
South Korea	1	0.47%
Spain	1	0.47%
Switzerland	5	2.33%
United Arab Emirates	1	0.47%
United States	142	66.05%
Global	17	7.91%
N/A	25	11.63%

Table 5

## B. Findings in Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Related Case Studies

We catalogued 215 case studies on Diversity, Equity & Inclusion (DEI) related case studies. These include case studies that incorporate scenarios reflecting challenges of diversity, equity, and inclusion in the workplace or diversity-informed decisions of a company. This section outlines trends in case study identity/ies of focus, topics, target segment / population, geographic breadth, industry, and discipline.

## Identity/ies of Focus

We also explored the identity/ies that case studies focused on. For example, was the case study focused on issues specifically related to women, to under-represented minorities or perhaps to individuals with lower socio-economic status?

The most common identity of focus in DEI-related cases is "gender" (40.93%) followed by race / ethnicity (20.00%), and sexual orientation (15.35%). Only 6.05% out of 215 case studies did the identity of focus include both gender and race / ethnicity diversity. Only 2.33% of case studies include discussions focused on diversity of abilities and immigrant / first-generation, and socio-economic diversity. Only 1.40% of the case studies focus on identity/ies related to asylee and refugee diversity. None of the cases include veterans as an identity of focus. Many of the case studies (30.23%) discussed DEI-related challenges and opportunities at a high level without focusing on particular identity/ies.

**DEI-Related Case Studies: Identity/ies of Focus** 

Identity/ies of Focus	Number of occurrences in 215 cases	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
	(#)	
Gender	88	40.93%
Race / Ethnicity	43	20.00%
Socio-economic	5	2.33%
Sexual Orientation	33	15.35%
Age	11	5.12%
Abilities	5	2.33%
Religious / Spiritual	8	3.72%

Asylee and Refugee	3	1.40%
Immigrant/First-generation	5	2.33%
Political Views	2	0.93%
Veterans	0	0.00%
Not specified / General	65	30.23%

Table 6

## Target Segment/Population

This category was created to analyze trends in the target population or segment that the case study focuses on. These include: Investors, Corporate Board/ Leadership, Workplace, Marketplace, Supply Chain, Entrepreneurs, General Population, Unions, Academic Leadership, Students, and N/A.

**DEI-Related Case Studies: Target Segment/Population** 

Target Segment / Population of the Case Study	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Workplace	118	54.88%
Corporate Board/leadership	33	15.35%
Marketplace	22	10.23%
Supply chain	3	1.40%
Investors	2	0.93%
Entrepreneurs	11	5.12%
General Population	17	7.91%
Unions	2	0.93%
Academic Leadership	4	1.86%
Students	6	2.79%
Military Official	1	0.47%
N/A	11	5.12%

Table 7

The most common target segments / populations include entry and mid-level employees in the Workplace (54.88% of DEI-related cases), Corporate Boards / Leadership (15.35%), followed by Marketplace (10.23%), General Population (7.91%), and Entrepreneurs (5.12%). The case studies that focused on entry and mid-level employees in the workplace generally addressed a specific DEI challenge or opportunity such as a diversity task force to increase diversity in hiring or develop a mentorship program for diverse employees, for example. Case studies that targeted the marketplace included topics such as diversity-informed product development / services and diversity-informed branding and marketing. Case studies targeting the "general population" were varied but included, for example, women around the world, women in a specific country, disenfranchised groups, among others.

Among the gaps, very few cases mentioned DEI-related challenges and opportunities occurring at the Supply Chain Level (1.40%) and among Investors (0.93%). The only two case studies on the target segment

of investors is case study "Fairview Capital<sup>38</sup>. The abstract of the case study mentions the following:"Fairview Capital is a pioneering alternative assets investment manager, as it is the first U.S. private equity fund of funds that focused on investing in private equity and venture capital funds managed by African-Americans and other minority investment managers. This case study focuses on Fairview's strategic decisions that ultimately led to the growth and expansion of its investment portfolio to over \$3 billion." For some case studies (5.12%) it was not clear whether there was a specific target segment but rather appeared to examine the topic of DEI broadly.

## **Topics**

To analyze trends related to topics of DEI-related case studies, we categorized DEI-related topics in the following high-level buckets: Diverse Board/org Leadership Gaps/Solutions, Diverse Employee Representation Gaps/Solutions, Compensation & Benefits, CSR/Foundations, Culture, Diversity and Entrepreneurship Gaps/Solutions, Diversity-Informed Branding/Marketing, Diversity-Informed Investment & Partnerships, Diversity-Informed Product Development/Services, Labor Rights / Governmental Policy, Navigating Personal Career, and Violence and Harassment.

The five most common primary topics in DEI-related case studies are culture<sup>39</sup> (in 34.88% of case DEI-related case studies), followed by Diverse Employee Representation Gaps / Solutions (21.40%), Navigating Personal Careers (8.84%), Compensation and Benefits (7.44%), Diversity and Entrepreneurship Gaps / Solutions (6.98%), Diverse Board / Organizational Leadership Gaps / Solutions (6.51%), and Diversity-informed Branding / Marketing (4.19%). Of the 215 DEI-related case studies, the least common topics include Labor Rights (0.47%), CSR / Foundations (2.79%), and Violence and Harassment (4.65%).

## **DEI-Related Case Studies: DEI Topic**

DEI Topics	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Diversity and entrepreneurship gaps / solutions	15	6.98%
Diverse employee representation gaps / solutions	46	21.40%
Culture*	75	34.88%
Compensation & Benefits*	16	7.44%
Navigating personal career	19	8.84%
Diversity-informed branding / marketing	9	4.19%
Diversity-informed investment & partnerships	12	5.58%
Diversity-informed product development / services	10	4.65%
CSR / Foundations*	6	2.79%
Labor rights (Governmental policy)	1	0.47%

Diverse board / org leadership gaps / solutions	14	6.51%
Violence and Harassment	10	4.65%
N/A	16	7.44%

Table 8

For each case study, we also categorized and analyzed DEI sub topics. The sub-topics included: Allyship, Changing Norms, Childcare/Eldercare, Discrimination & Unconscious bias, Dual Career Couple, Economic Empowerment, Hiring & Recruiting Practices, Mentorship & Sponsorship, Parental Leave, Pay Equity, Professional Development Programs for Diverse Employees/ERGs, Promotion & Evaluation Practices, Quotas and Incentives, Retention of Older/ Younger Employees, Return to Work, Sexual or Verbal Harassment, Strategy, Work-life Balance & Flexible Work, Other, and N/A.

The most common sub-topics include Strategy (14.88 % of DEI-related cases), Hiring and Recruiting (16.28%), Discrimination and Unconscious Bias (15.35%). Many of the case studies were categorized as "N/A" (31.63%). Given our analysis was based on the abstracts of case studies (as outlined in the methodology section), it was not always clear or obvious what the sub-topic(s) were or if the case study had subtopics beyond the primary topic, hence being categorized as N/A. The least common sub-topics included Changing Norms (3.72%), Allyship (3.26%), Quotas (2.33%), Parental Leave (2.79%), Pay Equity (1.86%), Retention of Older / Younger Employees (1.86%), Childcare / Eldercare (1.40%), and Dual Career Couple (0.47%). All of these topics are prevalent in popular discourse, corporate reports and media which further highlights a gap between trends in industry / society and business school case studies.

#### **DEI-Related Case Studies: DEI Subtopic**

DEI Subtopic	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Allyship	7	3.26%
Changing Norms	8	3.72%
Childcare / eldercare	3	1.40%
Discrimination & unconscious bias	33	15.35%
Dual Career Couple	1	0.47%
Economic empowerment	8	3.72%
Hiring & recruiting practices	35	16.28%
Mentorship & sponsorship	3	1.40%
Parental leave	6	2.79%
Pay equity	4	1.86%
Professional development programs for diverse employees / ERGs	16	7.44%
Promotion & evaluation practices	15	6.98%
Quotas and incentives	5	2.33%
Retention of older / younger employees	4	1.86%

Return to work	3	1.40%
Sexual or verbal harassment	13	6.05%
Strategy	32	14.88%
Work-life balance & flexible work	12	5.58%
Other	1	0.47%
N/A	68	31.63%

Table 9

## **Disciplines**

The majority of the cases focused on DEI-related issues are in the disciplines of Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior (58.60%) and General Management (11.16%). Entrepreneurship (8.84%) and Marketing (6.05%) were also some of the most common disciplines in the case studies. Among the least common disciplines, 0.93% of the case studies had the discipline of Supply Chain. Furthermore, 0.47% had the discipline of Economics as well as International Business. There is a need for additional case studies on these other core disciplines as well as Political Economy, Operations Management, and Business Information Systems.

## **DEI-Related Case Studies: Disciplines**

Discipline	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Human Resource Management /	126	58.60%
Organizational Behavior		
General Management	24	11.16%
Entrepreneurship	19	8.84%
Marketing	13	6.05%
Strategy	11	5.12%
Accounting and Finance	6	2.79%
Business and Government Relations	7	3.26%
Business Ethics	17	7.91%
Business Information Systems,	0	0.00%
Economics	1	0.47%
Information Systems	0	0.00%
International Business	1	0.47%
Law	0	0.00%
Leadership	4	1.86%
Operations Management	0	0.00%
Political Economy	0	0.00%
Supply Chain	2	0.93%
N/A	0	0.00%

Table 10

## Geographic Breadth

We categorized the case studies based on geography and country of focus. Cases where the scenario was focused on 2 or more countries were categorized as Global (13.02%). Although most retrieved cases took place in the United States (46.51%), cases focused internationally mostly took place in Asia. Out of 215 DEI-related case studies, 5.58% of cases mentioned a company based in India and/or with locations in India. Examples of such cases are "Women as Leaders: Lessons from Political Quotas in India", "ABB India: Leveraging Diversity and Inclusion", "Bandhan (A): Advancing Financial Inclusion in India". Some case studies (18.60%) did not disclose a particular geographical location.

## **DEI-Related Case Studies: Geographic Breadth**

Geographic Breadth	Number of occurrences in 230 cases	Percentage of 230 cases (%)
	(#)	
Australia	1	0.47%
Bangladesh	1	0.47%
Belgium	1	0.47%
Canada	6	2.79%
China	1	0.47%
Denmark	1	0.47%
India	12	5.58%
Italy	1	0.47%
Japan	4	1.86%
Lebanon	1	0.47%
Netherlands	2	0.93%
Niger	1	0.47%
Nigeria	1	0.47%
Singapore	2	0.93%
South Korea	1	0.47%
Spain	2	0.93%
Switzerland	4	1.86%
United Arab Emirates	2	0.93%
United Kingdom	4	1.86%
United States	100	46.51%
Global	28	13.02%
N/A	40	18.60%

Table 11

## **Industries and Sectors**

Case studies were categorized by industry as well. The most common industries are Financial Services (21.40%), Information (14.88%), and Professional / Business Services (12.09%). The least common industries are Leisure and Hospitality (2.33%), Natural Resources and Mining (1.40%), and Education,

Health Services, and Social Assistance (all at 4.19%). Within education in particular, the main DEI topic(s) of focus were Employee Representation and Culture. Of these case studies 14.42% did not take place in a particular industry, but were general.

**DEI-Related Case Studies: Industries and Sectors** 

Industries and Sectors	Number of occurrences in 215 cases (#)	Percentage of 215 cases (%)
Natural Resources and Mining	3	1.40%
Construction	0	0.00%
Manufacturing	16	7.44%
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	30	13.95%
Information	32	14.88%
Financial Services	46	21.40%
Professional and Business Services	26	12.09%
Education, Health Services, and Social Assistance	9	4.19%
Leisure and Hospitality	5	2.33%
Other services (except Public Administration)	1	0.47%
Public Administration	13	6.05%
N/A	31	14.42%

Table 12

## LIMITATIONS

During the discovery, selection, and categorization process of the research, we encountered various limitations:

- Our list of DEI-related case studies and case studies with diverse protagonists is not exhaustive: We recognized that there are more case studies available online. While we reviewed up to 10 search pages per query (which are ranked by relevance and popularity), we recognize that there are other cases that exist and were not categorized or analyzed. However, based on the algorithms of the platforms, we do feel confident that we were able to collect the most popular, relevant and utilized cases.
- The classifications and organization of published case studies vary based on the publisher: Most of our case studies were retrieved from Harvard Business Publishing, given that it is the publisher with the most available case studies. In their website, case studies are classified by Disciplines, Objectives, Subjects, Geography, and Industry. Other websites did not classify their case studies in the same format and case studies in the Case Center website did not include any specific information about the Disciplines, Objectives, Subjects, Geography, and Industry of each case study. To ensure consistency between cases on different websites, each case abstract was manually reviewed regardless of which website it was retrieved from. To ensure all cases were categorized accurately, the description of each case study was closely examined to identify the appropriate

- Disciplines, Objectives, Subjects, Geography, and Industry of each case study. The description of the case studies was also helpful in identifying additional information to include in cases where the Disciplines, Objectives, Subjects, Geography, and Industry were already disclosed. There may be some discrepancies and subjectivity therefore in the categorization of these topics.
- Defining the different forms of diversity: One of the greatest challenges of our research was the creation of categories to include in our section for Identity/ies of protagonists and Identity/ies of focus. Only individuals were identified in categories of racial/ethnic diversity or gender diversity, unless another identity was explicitly included in the description of the case. In which case we included these other diverse representations of identity (e.g., sexual orientation, ability status). We recognize this is limited as the description is likely not inclusive of the various identities a certain individual identifies with.
  - When not made explicit in the case study description, we tried to confirm diversity in categories of race/ethnicity and gender binary through online research, but without self-identification of the referenced individuals, these categories are obviously subject to further inquiry. Not all cases disclosed how each *Identity/ies of focus* identify themselves and we did not make any assumptions based on their name. We recognize that people's diverse identity may be hidden, may be fluid or undefined, and/or cannot be simply categorized into "one bucket".
  - Furthermore, there may be cases where the *Identity/ies of focus* or *Identity/ies of protagonists* have multiple backgrounds and are multi-ethnic. Thus, we did not make specific identifications such as *Hispanic, Persian, Caucasian* and instead created broader denominations such as *Race/ethnicity diversity*, given that cases would rarely mention specific details about a person's country of origin or nationality. Since our objective was to make a total count of the amount of cases that would focus, disclose, or incorporate race, gender, and ethnicity, we aimed to make each category as inclusive and comprehensive as possible. This would also help avoid bias in the selection criteria and to ensure more accuracy as we would not be able to accurately affirm whether someone is Hispanic, Latino or Mexican American, for example. We struggled identify/ing when it was or was not appropriate to use such categories and if their ethnicity or race was not disclosed in the description, then we did not attempt to determine their particular race or ethnicity.
- Personal bias: Although we aimed to avoid assumptions, our own personal bias could have also affected how certain case studies were reviewed. Our educational background and lived experiences impact how we view and categorize some cases, particularly related to DEI topics. We tried to be as objective as possible through known categorizations and definitions, however categorizing in itself can have subjective aspects to it. Diversity can be context specific and in some cases, difficult to assess (e.g., age diversity) and requires larger contextual knowledge. We tackled this through creating metrics and clear definitions in our methodology and analysis.
- Re-editing previously categorized case studies on the spreadsheet: A challenge of the Disciplines, and Industries/Sectors section was that new categories were added as we progressed with our work. New items were included as we saw the need for them based on the description of new case studies. Since new items were added mid-way through the categorization of case studies, we had to review our previous work to ensure all case studies were analyzed equally, with the most up-to-date

- information. Thus, one of our challenges was revising previous work, creating new *Disciplines*, and *Industries/Sectors*, and ensuring consistency across the whole document.
- Case studies were read in English: Although some case studies were translated from its primary language, all of the cases were read in English. This might also thus limit the amount of case studies drawn from other geographies not primarily English speaking.

## DISCUSSION

## **DEI topics & target segments:**

The topics of DEI-related cases are limited. Among the DEI-case studies, the majority of the disciplines were HR and Organizational Behavior related (58.60%). The most common topics are Culture (34.88%) followed by Diverse Employee Representation Gaps / Solutions (21.40%). The most common sub-topics include Strategy (14.88%), Hiring and Recruiting (16.28%), Discrimination and Unconscious Bias (15.35%).

DEI-related case studies lack the myriad of topics and scenarios where DEI challenges and opportunities prevail in today's society. Other critical topics are largely missing with 4.65% mentioning scenarios of Violence and Harassment, 0.47% including Dual Career Couples, 1.40% addressing Childcare / Eldercare, 1.40% addressing Return to Work (1.40%) and 1.86% discussing Pay Equity. This topical lack among case studies is interesting because these topics are prevalent in popular discourse, corporate reports and media which further highlights a gap (or delay, potentially) between trends in industry / society and business school case studies.

Relatedly, there is a focus of DEI-related cases in the Workplace (54.88%), but a lack in other key areas. Few cases focus on DEI in the Supply chain (1.40%) or among Investors (0.93%). Additionally, only 1.86% of the 215 cases mention scenarios occurring among Academic Leadership and 0.47% include scenarios focused on Military Officials. <sup>40</sup> Addressing DEI in academic leadership (i.e. faculty) is also critical, and is of increasing importance to universities as reflected in growing priorities for DEI among business schools. Furthermore, the lack of diversity among faculty further reinforces lack of DEI-related and diverse protagonists cases discussed and incorporated in courses. Hesitancy to incorporate these types of cases due to uncertainty around how to discuss and adequately address sensitive diversity topics is common.

## Identity/ies of focus:

There is a lack of cases with protagonists that are not white men. Of the approximately 19,000 cases on Harvard Business Publishing (HBP) Education cases<sup>41</sup> (which comprise ~80% of cases used in business schools globally by some estimates), it is difficult to make estimates on cases with diverse protagonists but we do find some indications. Approximately 1.3% of cases on HBP appear in searches for "African American" or "Black". When searching terms on Harvard Business School Publishing we found 1,826 cases (or 9.45% of total cases) appearing for "woman", "gender" and "she".

The majority of cases catalogued with diverse protagonists focus on white women. The most common diverse protagonist cases were on white women followed by non-white men. Out of 215 cases, 83.72% portray a protagonist representing gender diversity (i.e. female protagonist) and 28.84% highlight a protagonist representing race / ethnicity diversity (i.e., under-represented minority (URM)). Several cases

have a protagonist that is both female and a URM (18.60%). Among cases with diverse protagonists, only 4.65% of cases included a protagonist with Sexual Orientation diversity.

The majority of DEI cases catalogued also focus on gender. The most common identity of focus in DEI-related cases is gender (40.93% of 215 cases) followed by race / ethnicity (20%). Few cases (6.05%) focused on DEI-related issues and opportunities for both race and gender. Many DEI-related cases did not specify a particular identity/ies of focus (30.23%).

Identities beyond gender (particularly cis female) and/or race are lacking, with some identities few and far between. In the DEI-related case studies, only 2.33% of case studies include discussions focused on diversity of abilities and immigrant / first-generation, and socio-economic diversity. Only 1.40% of the case studies focus on identity/ies related to asylee and refugee diversity. None of the cases include veterans as an identity of focus.

Among cases focused on Socio-economic diversity, the majority discussed poverty alleviation programs, <sup>42</sup> underserved communities, <sup>43</sup> and loans for low-income women entrepreneurs, <sup>44</sup> and candidates from various "social and cultural backgrounds." <sup>45</sup> Among cases addressing Sexual Orientation diversity, the majority mention the topic broadly. <sup>46</sup> Although some cases mention Age diversity broadly, <sup>47</sup> five cases depict scenarios centered on the recruitment/retention of younger and older employees, <sup>48</sup> the role played by older/younger executives, generational diversity, <sup>49</sup> and a scenario where a young couple faces a career decision. <sup>50</sup> This highlights important gaps in what kinds of identities are included in business school case studies related to DEI topics. <sup>51</sup>

## **Disciplines:**

The most common discipline among the DEI-related Case Studies is Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior (58.60%), followed by General Management (11.16%). Among the Diverse Protagonist Case Studies, Human Resources / Organizational Behavior is also by far the most common discipline (40.00% of 215 cases). Among the diverse protagonists cases, the second most common discipline is Entrepreneurship (25.58% of cases). Surprisingly only 8.84% of DEI-related cases were on topics of Entrepreneurship. Among diverse protagonists, 9.47% were in Marketing, but in DEI-related cases 6.05% were in Marketing.

Various disciplines are almost non-existent among both case study groups. Both lacked cases on Leadership (only 1.40% in diverse protagonists cases and 1.86% in DEI-related cases) highlighting a need for more cases in this topic area. The same percentages were true for Accounting and Finance (5.12% in diverse protagonists cases and 2.79% in DEI-related cases). There are also few cases across both case study groups in Supply Chain (only 0.93% in Diverse Protagonist Cases and 0.93% in DEI-related cases), Political Economy, Economics, International Business and Negotiation. Of the cases with diverse protagonists, the majority of the protagonists with gender diversity were portrayed in the discipline of Entrepreneurship and Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior.

#### **Industries and Sectors:**

The top industry among both case study groups is Financial Services (21.40% of DEI-related cases, 21.86% of diverse protagonists). The second most common industry among both groups is Information (14.88% of

DEI-related cases, 16.74% of Diverse Protagonist Cases). Among the Diverse Protagonist Cases, the industry of Trade, Transportation and Utilities is also common (14.88% of cases).

## Geography:

Of the 215 DEI-related Case Studies, 46.51% took place in the United States while only 13.48% had a global focus. Only 7.91% of cases with diverse protagonists mentioned two or more countries in the abstract. Similarly, 66.05% of 215 cases with diverse protagonists took place in the United States. Outside of the United States, the majority of DEI-related Case Studies focused internationally mostly took place in India (5.58%). On the other hand, most internationally-focused cases with diverse protagonists took place in Switzerland (2.33%), Japan, and India (both at 1.86%).

#### **Perpetuation of stereotypes:**

In addition to the lack of diversity profiles and DEI-related topics, it is important to explore the content of cases, including language used to describe protagonists and scenarios. Indeed, many case studies inadvertently reinforce harmful stereotypes and gender norms.<sup>52</sup> A study examining case studies taught in Stanford's MBA Core Curriculum<sup>53</sup>, found that 16% of the protagonists were female; but more, these cases were also primarily in "pink" industries. They also found that cases with female protagonists reinforced stereotypes of women as communal and men as agentic. The same study found other stereotypes reinforced in cases related to race, national origin and age as well. Similar findings were identified in study by Sharen & McGowan (2018), which found that 20% of business school case studies among their sample had female protagonists and those females were represented as emotional, cautious, overwhelmed and less visionary, action-oriented, and innovative than men.<sup>54</sup> In addition, female protagonists' credentials were mentioned more frequently as opposed to their male colleagues. Moreover, a quarter of the reviewed case studies involved a scenario where a female protagonist questions her competence. However, male protagonists did not have the same scenarios.

While we did not analyze text of the case studies as part of this scope, we also saw how harmful norms and stereotypes are perpetuated in cases. Indeed, in some retrieved cases, characters' descriptions of gender, race, and ethnicity are presented in problematic ways. For instance, the case study titled "Carmichael Roberts: To Create a Private Equity Firm?", the author described the protagonist as a "rare African-American venture capitalist" instead of "an African-American venture capitalist." The author's selection of the word *rare* could mean that there are very few African-American venture capitalists, yet defining an African American as *rare* could also unintentionally commodify the protagonist, which poses questions about the nature, intent, and revision of the case study.

In another instance, the case study titled "Organizational Behavior: Management Diversity in the Large Corporation" had language that stereotyped women, blacks, Asians, and Hispanics in the description by mentioning "How do you manage talented people that are different from the typical corporate profile like women, blacks, Asians, Hispanics and others?" While published in 1993, this case presents diverse individuals as 'atypical' and as 'others' requiring different management approaches. The case also mentioned, "ways that women and minorities can take responsibility for their own success in the corporate environment." Lastly, the case study <u>Director's Dilemma: Balancing Between Quality and Diversity</u> perpetuates the common narrative of diversity as an exception in admissions acceptances, working against "quality". The case study mentions "One of them (major concerns of the admissions team) was what was

the exact situation of IIM Kashipur in terms of quality and diversity?" The title of the case study as well as the description implies that more diversity in a program equals less quality; this is problematic and does not reflect the wealth of research on the business case for diversity illustrates the business benefits.<sup>56</sup>

Ultimately, it is important to acknowledge that quantity is not enough - cases and authors must also be aware and critical of how they can be perpetuating harmful stereotypes and norms.

#### **Authors:**

The majority of the primary authors (those first listed) are male in both DEI-related Cases and Diverse Protagonist Case Studies. We did not analyze or explore race / ethnicity. Of the DEI-related cases, 55.35% of the primary authors are male while 42.33% are female authors. This doesn't mean that women were also not included as authors. On the contrary, most cases have multiple authors and include gender diversity among them. However, the primary author (those first listed) were predominantly male. Since case study publications generally require a professor / faculty member as a first author, this difference could hypothetically be linked to the representation gaps between male and female faculty in higher education. Interestingly, there are certain professors that have written various cases related highlighting DEI scenarios in the workplace. The gender gap between male and female primary authors is greaters in *Diverse Protagonist Case Studies*, given that 67.91% of the primary authors are male while only 32.09% of the cases have a female primary author.

## CALL TO ACTION

This exercise has revealed various gaps and opportunities in case studies used in business school curriculum. The workplace and business world is increasingly diverse and dynamic. Based on this analysis, there are recommendations for case study authors and faculty, business schools and case study publications.

## For case study authors & faculty:

- 1. **Use cases with diverse protagonists and on DEI topics.** Use EGAL's <u>Case Compendium</u> to identify cases. We have created a <u>survey tool</u> for any faculty member (at Haas and beyond) to help find cases appropriate for their particular context. We review this survey monthly to respond to faculty needs and requests.
- 2. Write and publish more case studies with diverse protagonists -- particularly intersectional identities. The majority of cases with diverse protagonists were on white women followed by non-white men. Few case studies incorporated discussion of other identities, especially identities that can be "hidden" such as people of diverse sexual orientation. Case studies that incorporate various intersections of identities are critical.
- 3. Write and publish on topics of DEI outside of Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior-- and particularly across core curriculum courses. Businesses are integrating DEI considerations across their operations, not just related to HR and the workplace. As examples, Unilever has mandated that none of its marketing perpetuates harmful norms, and that brands must actually promote positive norms. Secondly, in recent years Google teams focused on equity and inclusion have proliferated across product development and marketing (e.g., Equity Engineering, Machine Learning Fairness, Responsible AI). To reflect these new realities business schools need

- to keep up and have cases that incorporate learnings that are necessary for business leaders of today and tomorrow.
- 4. Ensure case study language that one writes or uses in classes does not commodify / discriminate against certain identities, and/or perpetuate stereotypes and harmful norms. Several case studies incorporated problematic language related to DEI. EGAL has developed a Glossary of Key Terms for Equity Fluent Leaders as a starting point for authors including DEI language, potentially problematic terms and alternatives, as well as gender pronouns and rules of thumb. However, the reflection of stereotypes and harmful norms in cases highlights a much larger issue of biases of case study authors, which are often faculty.
- 5. **Utilize and partner with centers, such as EGAL.** For faculty at Haas, EGAL can help write case studies or support research in case study development. Faculty at other universities may have similar centers to draw on. Also, EGAL can help faculty identify appropriate cases to use in different classroom settings. We have created a <u>survey tool</u> for any faculty member (at Haas and beyond) to help find cases appropriate for their particular context. We review this survey monthly to respond to faculty needs and requests.

## For business schools:

- 1. Encourage and incentivize faculty to utilize case studies with diverse protagonists or case studies on DEI topics in their courses -- assuming the case(s) align with their course and teaching goals. Many faculty use the same case studies year after year. While this can provide comfort and expertise in facilitating a certain case, there is opportunity to explore diversifying the case studies used in classrooms to enhance equity fluency among students. See the EGAL Case Compendium outlining the case studies with diverse protagonists (tab 1) and case studies on DEI topics (tab 2). If faculty are interested in a case study on a particular topic and/or for a certain industry, they can fill out this form to request it. The EGAL team will then try to locate an appropriate case study for the individual and add it to the compendium over time.
- 2. Partner with centers such as EGAL to write case studies filling key gaps, and informing faculty of case study options. Leveraging and supporting centers with mandates to enhance equity fluency in education, such as EGAL, can enable case study publications to fill key gaps in publications and provide needed support to business schools.
- 3. Educate case study authors / faculty on topics of power, privilege, discrimination, bias and structural inequities and how they can manifest in the classroom. The trends in case studies around perpetuation of stereotypes and harmful norms reflects biases among case study authors who are faculty members. This is also reflected in the lack of diverse faculty at business schools. While diversifying faculty is important, also critical is working with current faculty around these topics to ensure they are not inadvertently reinforced in education.
- 4. Relatedly, support faculty and lecturers with specific resources and educational opportunities to integrate DEI in the classroom. A constraint to faculty using cases with diverse protagonists or on DEI-related topics is lack of comfort on sensitive topics of diversity. Resources and educational opportunities to learn how to facilitate cases and incorporate DEI topics in their classrooms is important. For example, how can faculty facilitate tough conversations around identity or navigate when different challenges are brought up from students? We encourage business schools to provide educational support, tools and resources for faculty on topics such as

navigating tough conversations in the classroom and supporting inclusive classroom environments for students of all identities.

## For case study publications:

- 1. Review case study applications and descriptions for problematic language that reinforces stereotypes and harmful norms, and flag this type of language.
- 2. Incentivize and encourage new case studies. In particular, this includes case studies written on DEI-related topics outside of the workplace and HR and case studies on diverse protagonists. For female protagonists, encourage case studies outside of gendered industries and domains.
- **3.** Encourage diversity in terms of who is writing case studies. The majority of case studies including with diverse protagonists and on DEI topics are written by men. We have not assumed their race or other aspects of their identity that can be hidden. We encourage case study publications to explore how to incentivize more diversity in case study authors and perspectives.

EGAL is dedicated to advancing equity fluency among students and business leaders. As part of this mission and based on this analysis, EGAL will work to fill various gaps. In particular, EGAL commits to:

- → Write case studies with diverse protagonists, particularly those representing intersectional identities and in industries/disciplines outside of HR and organizational management.
- → Write case studies on DEI-related topics relevant to core courses, particularly where they are missing. Where and when possible, we will prioritize diverse protagonists representing intersectionality.
- → Support faculty in writing / researching new cases (particularly for the above criteria), as well as finding relevant cases for use in their classrooms. The compendium is meant to fill this gap, as well as the survey tool for specific help and support. We will continue to update the compendium.
- → Work with the D&I team at Haas to share the compendium and this analysis with their team and the broader Haas community, particularly faculty members and lecturers. In addition, we will work with the D&I team to highlight needed training and support for faculty and lecturers to appropriately and effectively integrate cases in their courses. Where possible and requested, we will help the D&I team in such training.

It is critical that the education system is able to respond to the needs of its students and the evolving business needs, as well as the world more broadly. There is both a gap and an opportunity related to business school case studies. Advancing equity fluency among current and future business leaders is critical for sustainable, successful businesses in an increasingly interconnected world.

## **APPENDIX**

- Description of Case Study: The majority of case studies included a description, which was
  utilized to analyze and categorize its Target Segment, Identity/ites of Focus, Main
  Diversity and Inclusion Topic, and Geographic Location.
- O Learning Objective: The majority case studies included the learning objective of the case study, which was also utilized to analyze and categorize its Target Segment, Identity/ites of Focus, Main Diversity and Inclusion Topic, and Geographic location. When case studies did not include a learning objective, the description of the case study was mostly utilized to determine such information.
- O Discipline: Accounting and Finance, Business and Government Relations, Business Ethics, Business Information Systems, Economics, Entrepreneurship, Finance, General Management, Information Systems, International Business, Marketing, Operations Management, Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior, and Strategy. Most discipline categories were provided by the Harvard Business Review. If they were not disclosed, disciplines were selected based on the descriptions provided by the case studies. <a href="https://www.unr.edu/business/departments-and-disciplines">https://www.unr.edu/business/departments-and-disciplines</a> and <a href="https://www.wit.ie/schools/business/business/business/discipline">https://www.wit.ie/schools/business/business/business/discipline</a> areas
- O Potential Core Courses Appropriate to Use: Applied Innovation Elective, Brand Management, Business History, Career Planning/Advancement, Corporate Social Responsibility, Corporate Strategy, Data and Decisions, Economics for Business Decision-Making, Ethics and Responsibility in Business, Financial Accounting, Fundamentals of Design Thinking, General Management, Growth Strategy, International Business, Introduction to Finance, Leadership Communication, Leading People, Macroeconomics in the Global Economy, Marketing Strategy, Negotiations, Operations, Organizational Culture, Organizational Development, Portfolio Management, Social Entrepreneurship, and Strategic Leadership. This category emerged from understanding if disciplines could be linked to courses provided by the Haas School of Business. Potential Core Courses were selected based on UC Berkeley's MBA Curriculum<sup>59</sup>. To ensure each case study was categorized appropriately, courses were selected based on the description of the case, the key words listed in the "Subjects" section disclosed within the Case Study, and by cross-referencing the syllabus of each course with the description of the case study. (Verify if there is a leadership course that was added from another university's curriculum).
- Identity/ies of Protagonists: Age Diversity, Asylee/Refugee Diversity, Gender Diversity, Immigrant/First-generation Diversity, Physical and Psychological Diversity, Political Views Diversity, Racial/Ethnic Diversity, Religious/Spiritual Diversity, Sexual Orientation Diversity, Socio-economic Diversity, N/A. To avoid excluding certain diversity identities, categories such as "Age Diversity", "Gender Diversity", "Religious Diversity" were created. Although it is not an exhaustive list of all possible identities a person can relate to, this section was done with the aim of understanding trends and gaps in the way profiles are portrayed in case studies. To ensure the research was the least biased as possible, each case study was categorized based on the description provided. Given that it is not possible to accurately define a protagonists' gender, religion, and age based on a search engine search, the categories of "Religious Diversity", "Political Diversity",

- "Refugee/Asylee Diversity" etc were not selected unless the description disclosed this information. If we were unable to confirm such information, we did not include the category.
- Or list for Industry Sector was retrieved from the United States Department of Labor<sup>60</sup> which grouped industries in the United States into ten main categories including: Natural Resources and Mining, Construction, Manufacturing, Trade, Transportation, and Utilities, Information, Financial Services, Professional and Business Services, Education and Health Services, Leisure and Hospitality, and Other Services.<sup>61</sup>
- Publishers' Name: ABI/Inform Global, Asian Case Research Journal, Asian Case Research Journal, Babson College Case Studies, Berkeley Haas School of Business, Business Case Journal, Business Source Complete, California Management Review, Darden Business Publishing, Emerald Insight Case Studies, Harvard Business Publishing, IMD Case Studies, Ivey Cases (University of Western Ontario Free Cases), Journal of Business Case Studies, Journal of Business Cases and Applications, Journal of Case Research in Business and Economics, Journal of Information Technology Teaching Cases, LearningEdge at MIT Sloan, MarketLine Advantage, Stanford Business School Case Database, The Asian Business Case Centre, and The Case Center.

#### **ENDNOTES**

1

https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1052562918812154?journalCode=jmed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Byrne, J. (2012). *How the world's top business schools teach their students*. Poets & Quants. Retrieved from <a href="https://poetsandquants.com/2012/11/18/how-the-worlds-top-business-schools-teach-their-mbas/">https://poetsandquants.com/2012/11/18/how-the-worlds-top-business-schools-teach-their-mbas/</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Moules, J. (2018, September 24). MBA Case Studies Lack Female Leaders. Retrieved from https://www.ft.com/content/036144a8-9f07-11e8-85da-eeb7a9ce36e4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This estimate was identified on May 5, 2020 through the "main case" search function on Harvard Business Publishing (<a href="https://hbsp.harvard.edu/search?N=4294930433&&Nrpp=25&action=refined">https://hbsp.harvard.edu/search?N=4294930433&&Nrpp=25&action=refined</a>).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> (2017). HBS Case Studies Need Diversity - Now. Poets & Quants. Retrieved from https://poetsandquants.com/2017/04/27/hbs-prof-case-studies-need-diversity-now/?pq-category=business-school-news

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Symons, L. (2016, March 10). Only 11% of Top Business School Case Studies Have a Female Protagonist. Retrieved from https://hbr.org/2016/03/only-11-of-top-business-school-case-studies-have-a-female-protagonist <sup>6</sup> Intersectionality is a term a term meaning that people can experience overlapping forms of discrimination based on social categorizations such as gender, race, ethnicity, sexual preference and socio-economic status.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Symons, L., & Ibarra, H. (2014, April 28). What the Scarcity of Women in Business Case Studies Really Looks Like. Retrieved from https://hbr.org/2014/04/what-the-scarcity-of-women-in-business-case-studies-really-looks-like Soule, S. A., Drabkin, D., & Mackenzie, L. (2019, June 24). The Stereotypes in MBA Case Studies. Retrieved from https://hbr.org/2019/06/the-stereotypes-in-mba-case-studies; Sharen, C. M., & McGowan, R. A. (2018, November 9). Invisible or Clichéd: How Are Women Represented in Business Cases? - Colleen M. Sharen, Rosemary A. McGowan, 2019. Retrieved from

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Ammerman, C., Trumbore, A., & Ajayi-Ore, L. (2019, June 24). The Case for Female Protagonists - Harvard Business Publishing Education. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/inspiring-minds/the-case-for-female-protagonists

protagonists <sup>10</sup> Ammerman, C., Trumbore, A., & Ajayi-Ore, L. (2019, June 24). The Case for Female Protagonists - Harvard Business Publishing Education. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/inspiring-minds/the-case-for-female-protagonists

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Vivian Hunt, Dennis Layton, and Sara Prince. (2015, January). "Why Diversity Matters." Retrieved from https://www.mckinsey.com/business-functions/organization/our-insights/why-diversity-matters.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> See a compendium of research on the business case related to diversity: <u>Business Case Tracker for Diversity in the Workplace</u> (Berkeley Haas' Center for Equity, Gender & Leadership). <u>https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1Ngbh5TXF4AKEdm1eUMPDIbmIHAn7Qorx/edit#gid=331876408</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Kennedy, J., & Kray, L. (2014, December 4). Who Is Willing to Sacrifice Ethical Values for Money and Social Status? Gender Differences in Reactions to Ethical Compromises. Retrieved from https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=2532701

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Kennedy, J., & Kray, L. (2014, December 4). Who Is Willing to Sacrifice Ethical Values for Money and Social Status? Gender Differences in Reactions to Ethical Compromises. Retrieved from https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\_id=2532701

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> (2019, June 11). Unilever's Purpose-led Brands Outperform. Retrieved from https://www.unilever.com/news/press-releases/2019/unilevers-purpose-led-brands-outperform.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> (2018, October 17). Landu, J. Why Cultural Sensitivity Should Be A Forethought Not An Afterthought. Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/sites/forbesnycouncil/2018/10/17/why-cultural-sensitivity-should-be-a-forethought-not-an-afterthought/#3e6db5fd1b69

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> MacLellan, L.(2018, December 30). Business School Case Studies Depict Women As More Overwhelmed and Less Visionary. Retrieved from https://qz.com/work/1479628/business-school-case-studies-are-biased-against-women-leaders/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Moules, J. (2019, June 14). Why Business Schools Still Have a Diversity Problem. Retrieved from https://www.ft.com/content/2276cf1e-86bc-11e9-97ea-05ac2431f453

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> A central problem in reporting and measuring diversity in MBA programs is how "minority" is defined. In the parlance of graduate business education, "U.S. minorities" are usually defined as African American or black, Hispanic or Latinx, Asian American, Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander, or two or more races. However, there is no commonly adhered-to standard for schools in reporting these populations; some use Asian-American students, by far the largest non-Caucasian group that applies to and attend B-school in the U.S., as a way to offset low enrollment of

black and Latinx students. Ethier, M. (2020, April 6). Minorities At The Top 25 U.S. MBA Programs. Retrieved from https://poetsandquants.com/2020/04/06/minorities-at-the-top-25-u-s-mba-programs/

<sup>20</sup> Ethier, M. (2020, April 6). Minorities At The Top 25 U.S. MBA Programs. Retrieved from https://poetsandquants.com/2020/04/06/minorities-at-the-top-25-u-s-mba-programs/

- <sup>21</sup>Fernandes, D. (2019, June 1). At Harvard Business School, diversity remains elusive The Boston Globe. Retrieved from https://www.bostonglobe.com/metro/2019/06/01/harvard-business-school-diversity-remainselusive/bpyxP4cE1iCQJdLbHQEaQI/story.html
- <sup>22</sup> Understanding Underrepresented Populations in the Business School Pipeline. (2018). Retrieved from https://www.gmac.com/-/media/files/gmac/research/research-report-series/rr-16-02-underrepresented-populationsv2.pdf
- <sup>23</sup> Understanding Underrepresented Populations in the Business School Pipeline. (2018).
- <sup>24</sup> MIT Ranks Well in Ethnic Diversity Study. (2019, January 31). Retrieved from https://www.collegefactual.com/colleges/massachusetts-institute-of-technology/news/massachusetts-institute-oftechnology-2019-college-diversity-ethnic-ranking/Diversity in the Curriculum. (2012). Retrieved from https://www.mbaroundtable.org/diversity
- <sup>25</sup>Life at Harvard: Diversity & Inclusion. (2020). Retrieved from https://college.harvard.edu/life-atharvard/diversity-inclusion; Diversity at Stanford GSB. (2020). Retrieved from https://www.gsb.stanford.edu/experience/diversity; University of California, Berkeley. (2020). Diversity and Inclusion: Full-Time MBA: Berkeley Haas. Retrieved from https://mba.haas.berkeley.edu/student-life/diversity; Fostering Inclusion and Diversity. (2020, April 30). Retrieved from https://som.yale.edu/programs/executiveeducation/for-individuals/leadership/fostering-inclusion-and-diversity
- <sup>26</sup> UC Berkeley's Haas School of Business. (2017). Equity Fluent Leadership. Retrieved from https://haas.berkeley.edu/mba/academics/course-planning/areas-of-emphasis/equity-fluent-leadership/ <sup>27</sup> https://haas.berkeley.edu/equity/
- <sup>28</sup> Case studies were acquired from the following publishers: Amity Business Academies, Babson College Case Studies, Berkeley Haas School of Business, Business Case Journal, California Management Review (Berkeley-Haas' Premier Management Journal), Columbia CaseWorks, Copenhagen Business School, Darden Business Publishing, ESSEC Business School, Harvard Business Review, IBS Case Development Center, IMD Case Studies, INSEAD, Ivey Publishing, Stanford Business School Case Database, The Case Center, etc.
- <sup>29</sup> Designing Search: Results Pages. (2013, October 25). Retrieved from https://uxmag.com/articles/designingsearch-results-pages
- <sup>30</sup> Park, J. (n.d.). Contact. Retrieved April 2020, from https://cmr.berkeley.edu/contact
- <sup>31</sup> (2017). HBS Prof: Case Studies Need Diversity Now. Poets & Quants. https://poetsandquants.com/2017/04/27/hbsprof-case-studies-need-diversity-now/?pq-category=business-school-news

  32 Industries at a Glance: NAICS Code Index. (2020, April 30). Retrieved from
- https://www.bls.gov/iag/tgs/iag index naics.htm
- According to the U.S. Department of Labor Statistics, the Information Sector comprises "establishments engaged" in the following processes: (a) producing and distributing information and cultural products, (b) providing the means to transmit or distribute these products as well as data or communications, and (c) processing data."
- The list of disciplines retrieved from the University of Nevada are: Accounting, Economics, Entrepreneurship, Finance, Information Systems, International Business, Management, and Marketing.
- <sup>35</sup> Departments and Disciplines: College of Business. (n.d.). Retrieved November 10, 2019, from https://www.unr.edu/business/departments-and-disciplines
- <sup>36</sup> The list of additional disciplines include: Business and Government Relations, Business Ethics, Business Information Systems, Law, Leadership, Operations Management, Human Resource Management / Organizational Behavior, Political Economy, Strategy, Supply Chain, and Negotiation.
- <sup>37</sup> University of California, Berkeley. (2020). Curriculum: Full-Time MBA: Berkeley Haas. Retrieved March 2020, from https://mba.haas.berkeley.edu/academics/curriculum
- <sup>38</sup> Rogers, S. S., & Collins, D. (2018, October 25). Fairview Capital. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/product/319050-PDF-ENG?Ntt=Steven+rogers&itemFindingMethod=Search
- <sup>39</sup> We use the following definition of "culture": Organizational culture defines the proper way to behave within the organization. This culture consists of shared beliefs and values established by leaders and then communicated and reinforced through various methods, ultimately shaping employee perceptions, behaviors and understanding. This definition was drawn from SHRM (the Society for Human Resource Management).

Denend, L., & Phills, J. (2007). Unitus (A): Microfinance 2.0 - Reinventing and Industry. Retrieved from https://www.gsb.stanford.edu/faculty-research/case-studies/unitus-microfinance-20-reinventing-industry

- <sup>43</sup>Lowery, B., & Denend, L. (2005). Neighborhood Health Clinic (A), Serving the Underserved in a Complex Environment. Retrieved from https://www.gsb.stanford.edu/faculty-research/case-studies/neighborhood-health-clinic-serving-underserved-complex-environment
- Walske, J., Foster, E., & Tyson, L. (2018, July 1). Grameen America: The Pivotal Role of Technology in Scaling. Retrieved from https://cases.haas.berkeley.edu/search/articleDetail.aspx?article=5918
- <sup>45</sup> Gupta, V., & Chakraborty, I. (2006). Diversity and Talent Management Practices at IBM. Retrieved from https://www.thecasecentre.org/educators/products/view?id=71022
- <sup>46</sup> Freeman, E., Dresnick, J., Mead, J., & Parmar, B. (2008, July 16). Differences and Diversity Issues: Selected Vignettes. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/product/UV1167-PDF-ENG?Ntt=diversity&itemFindingMethod=Search
- <sup>47</sup>Thomas, D. A., & Creary, S. J. (2011, June 24). Shifting the Diversity Climate: The Sodexo Solution. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/product/412020-PDF-ENG?Ntt=diversity&itemFindingMethod=Search
- <sup>48</sup> Chowdary, N. V., & Vivek, M. V. (2010). Age Diversity at Ashok Leyland Ltd: Narrowing the Generation Gap. Retrieved from https://www.thecasecentre.org/main/products/view?id=97569
- <sup>49</sup> Bhatnagar, M. (2015). Generational Diversity: The Evolving Workplace Conundrum. Retrieved from https://www.thecasecentre.org/main/products/view?id=130733
- <sup>50</sup> Groysberg, B., & Herman, K. (2014, February). The Rawlinsons: Facing Life and Career Decisions as a Couple ^ 414002. Retrieved from https://hbsp.harvard.edu/product/414002-PDF-ENG
- 51 Table #
- <sup>52</sup>Soule, S. A., Drabkin, D., & Mackenzie, L. (2019, June 24). The Stereotypes in MBA Case Studies. Retrieved from https://hbr.org/2019/06/the-stereotypes-in-mba-case-studies
- <sup>53</sup>Soule, S. A., Mackenzie, L., & Drabkin, D. (2018, November 9). The Stereotypes in MBA Case Studies. Retrieved from https://hbr.org/2019/06/the-stereotypes-in-mba-case-studies
- <sup>54</sup>Sharen, C. M., & McGowan, R. A. (2018, November 9). Invisible or Clichéd: How Are Women Represented in Business Cases? Colleen M. Sharen, Rosemary A. McGowan, 2019. Retrieved from https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1052562918812154?journalCode=jmed
- <sup>55</sup> Deb , M., & Sharma, V. K. (2017, February 10). Director's Dilemma: Balancing Between Quality and Diversity. Retrieved from https://www.thecasecentre.org/main/products/view?id=142126
- <sup>56</sup> See a compendium of research on the business case related to diversity: <u>Business Case Tracker for Diversity in the Workplace</u> (Berkeley Haas' Center for Equity, Gender & Leadership).
- <sup>57</sup> Semuels, A. (2017, November 27). Poor Girls Are Leaving Their Brothers Behind. Retrieved from https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2017/11/gender-education-gap/546677/
- <sup>58</sup>Satterfield, J. M. (2017, February 16). The Iceberg—Visible and Hidden Identity. Retrieved from https://www.thegreatcoursesdaily.com/visible-and-hidden-identity/
- <sup>59</sup> University of California, Berkeley. (n.d.). Curriculum: Full-Time MBA: Berkeley Haas. Retrieved from https://mba.haas.berkeley.edu/academics/curriculum
- About the data. (n.d.). Retrieved November 2019, from https://www.bls.gov/iag/
- <sup>61</sup>Industries at a Glance: NAICS Code Index. (n.d.). Retrieved November 2019, from https://www.bls.gov/iag/tgs/iag\_index\_naics.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Table 3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> This estimate was identified on May 5, 2020 through the "main case" search function on Harvard Business Publishing (<a href="https://hbsp.harvard.edu/search?N=4294930433&&Nrpp=25&action=refined">https://hbsp.harvard.edu/search?N=4294930433&&Nrpp=25&action=refined</a>).